

Brunei International Medical Journal

THE MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND UNIVERSITI BRUNEI DARUSSALAM

Volume 20

9 January 2024 (27 Jamaldilakhir 1445H)

CHATBOTS, GENERATIVE AI, AND SCHOLARLY MANU-SCRIPTS.

WAME Recommendations on Chatbots and Generative Artificial Intelligence in Relation to Scholarly Publications.

See Spanish language version in Colombia Médica

Revised May 31, 2023.

Chris Zielinski¹, Margaret A. Winker², Rakesh Aggarwal³, Lorraine E. Ferris⁴, Markus Heinemann⁵, Jose Florencio Lapeña, Jr⁶, Sanjay A. Pai⁷, Edsel Ing⁸, Leslie Citrome⁹, Murad Alam¹⁰, Michael Voight¹¹, Farrokh Habibzadeh¹², on behalf of the WAME Board.

¹Vice President, WAME; Centre for Global Health, University of Winchester, UK.

²Trustee, WAME; US.

³President, WAME; Associate Editor, Journal of Gastroenterology and Hepatology; Director, Jawaharlal Institute of Postgraduate Medical Education and Research, Puducherry, India.

waharlal Institute of Postgraduate Medical Education and Research, Puducherry, India.

Trustee, WAME; Professor, Dalla Lana School of Public Health, University of Toronto, Canada

Treasurer, WAME; Editor-in-Chief, The Thoracic and Cardiovascular Surgeon, Professor, Universitaetsmedizin Mainz, Germany.

Secretary, WAME; Editor-in-Chief, Philippine Journal of Otolaryngology Head & Neck Surgery; Professor, University of the Philippines Manila.

Director, WAME; Working Committee, The National Medical Journal of India.

Director, WAME; Section Editor, Canadian Journal of Ophthalmology; Professor, University of Toronto and University of Alberta, Canada.

Director, WAME; Editor-in-Chief, Current Medical Research and Opinion; Topic Editor for Psychiatry for Clinical Therapeutics; Clinical Professor of Psychiatry & Behavioral Sciences, New York Medical College, US.

Director, WAME; Editor-in-Chief, Archives of Dermatological Research; Professor, Northwestern University, US.

University, US.

11 Director, WAME; Executive Editor-in-Chief; International Journal of Sports Physical Therapy; Professor, Belmont University School of Physical Therapy, US.

¹²Past President, WAME; Editorial Consultant, The Lancet; Associate Editor, Frontiers in Epidemiology; Iran.

Brunei Int Med J. 2024;20:3-7

Brunei International Medical Journal (BIMJ) Official Publication of The Ministry of Health and Universiti Brunei Darussalam

EDITORIAL BOARD

Editor-in-Chief Ketan PANDE

Sub-Editors Vui Heng CHONG

William Chee Fui CHONG

Editorial Board Members Muhd Syafiq ABDULLAH

Alice Moi Ling YONG

Ahmad Yazid ABDUL WAHAB Jackson Chee Seng TAN Pemasiri Upali TELISINGHE

Pengiran Khairol Asmee PENGIRAN SABTU Dayangku Siti Nur Ashikin PENGIRAN TENGAH

INTERNATIONAL EDITORIAL BOARD MEMBERS

Lawrence HO Khek Yu (Singapore)

Wilfred PEH (Singapore)

Surinderpal S BIRRING (United Kingdom)

John YAP (United Kingdom) Nazar LUQMAN (Australia) Jose F LAPENA (Philippines) Chuen Neng LEE (Singapore)

Emily Felicia Jan Ee SHEN (Singapore)

Leslie GOH (United Kingdom)
Ian BICKLE (United Kingdom)
Christopher HAYWARD (Australia)

Advisor

Wilfred PEH (Singapore)

Past Editors-in-Chief

Nagamuttu RAVINDRANATHAN Kenneth Yuh Yen KOK Chong Vui Heng William Chong Chee Fui

Proof reader

John WOLSTENHOLME (CfBT Brunei Darussalam)

Aim and Scope of Brunei International Medical Journal

The Brunei International Medical Journal (BIMJ) is a six monthly peer reviewed official publication of the Ministry of Health under the auspices of the Clinical Research Unit, Ministry of Health, Brunei Darussalam.

The BIMJ publishes articles ranging from original research papers, review articles, medical practice papers, special reports, audits, case reports, images of interest, education and technical/innovation papers, editorials, commentaries and letters to the Editor. Topics of interest include all subjects that relate to clinical practice and research in all branches of medicine, basic and clinical including topics related to allied health care fields. The BIMJ welcomes manuscripts from contributors, but usually solicits reviews articles and special reports. Proposals for review papers can be sent to the Managing Editor directly. Please refer to the contact information of the Editorial Office.

Instruction to authors Manuscript submissions

All manuscripts should be sent to the Managing Editor, BIMJ, Ministry of Health, Brunei Darussalam; e-mail: editor-in-chief@bimjonline.com. Subsequent correspondence between the BIMJ and authors will, as far as possible via should be conducted via email quoting the reference number.

Conditions

Submission of an article for consideration for publication implies the transfer of the copyright from the authors to the BIMJ upon acceptance. The final decision of acceptance rests with the Editor-in-Chief. All accepted papers become the permanent property of the BIMJ and may not be published elsewhere without written permission from the BIMJ.

Ethics

Ethical considerations will be taken into account in the assessment of papers that have experimental investigations of human or animal subjects. Authors should state clearly in the Materials and Methods section of the manuscript that institutional review board has approved the project. Those investigators without such review boards should ensure that the principles outlined in the Declaration of Helsinki have been followed.

Manuscript categories Original articles

These include controlled trials, interventional studies, studies of screening and diagnostic tests, outcome studies, cost-effectiveness analyses, and large-scale epidemiological studies. Manuscript should include the following; introduction, materials and methods, results and conclusion. The objective should be stated clearly in the introduction. The text should not exceed 2500 words and references not more than 30.

Review articles

These are, in general, invited papers, but unsolicited reviews, if of good quality, may be considered. Reviews are systematic critical assessments of

literature and data sources pertaining to clinical topics, emphasising factors such as cause, diagnosis, prognosis, therapy, or prevention. Reviews should be made relevant to our local setting and preferably supported by local data. The text should not exceed 3000 words and references not more than 40.

Special Reports

This section usually consist of invited reports that have significant impact on healthcare practice and usually cover disease outbreaks, management guidelines or policy statement paper.

Audits

Audits of relevant topics generally follow the same format as original article and the text should not exceed 1,500 words and references not more than

Case reports

Case reports should highlight interesting rare cases or provide good learning points. The text should not exceed 1000 words; the number of tables, figures, or both should not be more than two, and references should not be more than 15.

Education section

This section includes papers (i.e. how to interpret ECG or chest radiography) with particular aim of broadening knowledge or serve as revision materials. Papers will usually be invited but well written paper on relevant topics may be accepted. The text should not exceed 1500 words and should include not more than 15 figures illustration and references

three relevant references should be included. Only images of high quality (at least 300dpi) will be acceptable.

Technical innovations

This section include papers looking at novel or new techniques that have been developed or introduced to the local setting. The text should not exceed 1000 words and should include not more than 10 figures illustration and references should not be more than 10.

Letters to the Editor

Letters discussing a recent article published in the BIMJ are welcome and should be sent to the Editorial Office by e-mail. The text should not exceed 250 words; have no more than one figure or table, and five references.

Criteria for manuscripts

Manuscripts submitted to the BIMJ should meet the following criteria: the content is original; the writing is clear; the study methods are appropriate; the data are valid; the conclusions are reasonable and supported by the data; the information is important; and the topic has general medical interest. Manuscripts will be accepted only if both their contents and style meet the standards required by the BIMJ.

Authorship information

Designate one corresponding author and provide a complete address, telephone and fax numbers, and e-mail address. The number of authors of each paper should not be more than twelve; a greater number requires justification. Authors may add a publishable footnote explaining order of authorship.

Group authorship

If authorship is attributed to a group (either solely or in addition to one or more individual authors), all members of the group must meet the full criteria and requirements for authorship described in the following paragraphs. One or more authors may take responsibility 'for' a group, in which case the other group members are not authors, but may be listed in an acknowledgement.

Authorship requirement

DISCLAIMER

All articles published, including editorials and letters, represent the opinion of the contributors and do not reflect the official view or policy of the Clinical Research Unit, the Ministry of Health or the institutions with which the contributors are affiliated to unless this is clearly stated. The appearance of advertisement does not necessarily constitute endorsement by the Clinical Research Unit or Ministry of Health, Brunei Darussalam. Furthermore, the publisher cannot accept responsibility for the correctness or accuracy of the advertisers' text and/or claim or any opinion expressed.

sign, and the analysis and interpretation of the data (where applicable); to have made substantial contributions to the writing or revision of the manuscript; and to have reviewed the final version of the submitted manuscript and approved it for publication. Authors will be asked to certify that their contribution represents valid work and that neither the manuscript nor one with substantially similar content under their authorship has been published or is being considered for publication elsewhere, except as described in an attachment. If requested, authors shall provide the data on which the manuscript is based for examination by the editors or their assignees.

Financial disclosure or conflict of interest

Any affiliation with or involvement in any organisation or entity with a direct financial interest in the subject matter or materials discussed in the manuscript should be disclosed in an attachment. Any financial or material support should be identified in the manuscript.

Copyright transfer

In consideration of the action of the BIMJ in reviewing and editing a submission, the author/s will transfer, assign, or otherwise convey all copyright ownership to the Clinical Research Unit, RIPAS Hospital, Ministry of Health in the event that such work is published by the BIMJ.

Acknowledgements

Only persons who have made substantial contributions but who do not fulfill the authorship criteria should be acknowledged.

Accepted manuscripts

Authors will be informed of acceptances and accepted manuscripts will be sent for copyediting. During copyediting, there may be some changes made to accommodate the style of journal format. Attempts will be made to ensure that the overall meaning of the texts are not altered. Authors will be informed by email of the estimated time of publication. Authors may be requested to provide raw data, especially those presented in graph such as bar charts or figures so that presentations can be constructed following the format and style of the journal. Proofs will be sent to authors to check for any mistakes made

CHATBOTS, GENERATIVE AI, AND SCHOLARLY MANUSCRIPTS.

WAME Recommendations on Chatbots and Generative Artificial Intelligence in Relation to Scholarly Publications.

See Spanish language version in Colombia Médica

Revised May 31, 2023.

Chris Zielinski¹, Margaret A. Winker², Rakesh Aggarwal³, Lorraine E. Ferris⁴, Markus Heinemann⁵, Jose Florencio Lapeña, Jr⁶, Sanjay A. Pai⁷, Edsel Ing⁸, Leslie Citrome⁹, Murad Alam¹⁰, Michael Voight¹¹, Farrokh Habibzadeh¹², on behalf of the WAME Board.

¹Vice President, WAME; Centre for Global Health, University of Winchester, UK.

²Trustee, WAME; US.

³President, WAME; Associate Editor, Journal of Gastroenterology and Hepatology; Director, Jawaharlal Institute of Postgraduate Medical Education and Research,

Puducherry, India.

⁴Trustee, WAME; Professor, Dalla Lana School of Public Health, University of Toronto,

Canada ⁵Treasurer, WAME; Editor-in-Chief, The Thoracic and Cardiovascular Surgeon, Professor, Universitaetsmedizin Mainz, Germany.

⁶Secretary, WAME; Editor-in-Chief, Philippine Journal of Otolaryngology Head & Neck Surgery; Professor, University of the Philippines Manila.

Director, WAME; Working Committee, The National Medical Journal of India.

⁸Director, WAME; Section Editor, Canadian Journal of Ophthalmology; Professor, Uni-

versity of Toronto and University of Alberta, Canada.

Director, WAME; Editor-in-Chief, Current Medical Research and Opinion; Topic Editor for Psychiatry for Clinical Therapeutics; Clinical Professor of Psychiatry & Behavioral Sciences, New York Medical College, US.

10 Director, WAME; Editor-in-Chief, Archives of Dermatological Research; Professor,

Northwestern University, US.

11 Director, WAME; Executive Editor-in-Chief; International Journal of Sports Physical Therapy; Professor, Belmont University School of Physical Therapy, US.

¹²Past President, WAME; Editorial Consultant, The Lancet; Associate Editor, Frontiers in Epidemiology; Iran.

INTRODUCTION

This statement revises our earlier "WAME Recommendations on ChatGPT and Chatbots in Relation to Scholarly Publications" (January 20, 2023). The revision reflects the proliferation of chatbots and their expanding use in scholarly publishing over the last few months, as well as emerging concerns regarding lack of authenticity of content when using chatbots. These Recommendations are intended to inform editors and help them develop policies for the use of chatbots in papers published in their journals. They aim to help authors and reviewers understand how best to attribute the use of chatbots in their work, and to address the need for all journal editors to have access to manuscript screening tools. In this rapidly evolving field, we will continue to modify these recommendations as the software and its applications develop.

A chatbot is a tool "[d]riven by [artificial intelligence], automated rules, natural-language processing (NLP), and machine

Corresponding author: Chris Zielinski, Vice President, WAME; Centre for Global Health, University of Winchester, UK.

Email: chris@chriszielinski.com

learning (ML)...[to] process data to deliver responses to requests of all kinds."¹ Artificial intelligence (AI) is "the ability of a digital computer or computer-controlled robot to perform tasks commonly associated with intelligent beings."²

"Generative modeling is an artificial intelligence technique that generates synthetic artifacts by analyzing training examples; learning their patterns and distribution; and then creating realistic facsimiles. Generative AI (GAI) uses generative modeling and advances in deep learning (DL) to produce diverse content at scale by utilizing existing media such as text, graphics, audio, and video."^{3,4}

Chatbots are activated by a plainlanguage instruction, or "prompt," provided by the user. They generate responses using statistical and probability-based language models.⁵ This output has some characteristic properties. It is usually linguistically accurate and fluent but, to date, it is often compromised in various ways. For example, chatbot output currently carries the risk of including biases, distortions, irrelevancies, misrepresentations, and plagiarism - many of which are caused by the algorithms governing its generation and heavily dependent on the contents of the materials used in its training. Consequently, there are concerns about the effects of chatbots on knowledge creation and dissemination - including their potential to spread and amplify mis- and disinformation⁶ - and their broader impact on jobs and the economy, as well as the health of individuals and populations. New legal issues have also arisen in connection with chatbots and generative AI.7

Chatbots retain the information supplied to them, including content and prompts, and may use this information in future responses.⁸ Therefore, scholarly content that is generated or edited using AI would be re-

tained and as a result, could potentially appear in future responses, further increasing the risk of inadvertent plagiarism on the part of the user and any future users of the technology. Anyone who needs to maintain confidentiality of a document, including authors, editors, and reviewers, should be aware of this issue before considering using chatbots to edit or generate work.⁹

Chatbots and their applications illustrate the powerful possibilities of generative AI, as well as the risks. These Recommendations seek to suggest a workable approach to valid concerns about the use of chatbots in scholarly publishing.

A note on changes introduced since the previous WAME Recommendations

A new recommendation (#4) has been added to the four original principal recommendations: 1) Only humans can be authors; 2) Authors should acknowledge the sources of their materials; 3) Authors must take public responsibility for their work; 4) Editors and reviewers should specify, to authors and each other, any use of chatbots in evaluation of the manuscript and generation of reviews and correspondence; and 5) Editors need appropriate digital tools to deal with the effects of chatbots on publishing.

In addition, this revision acknowledges that chatbots are used to perform different functions in scholarly publications. Currently, individuals in scholarly publishing may use chatbots for: 1) simple word-processing tasks (analogous to, and an extension of, word-processing and grammar-checking software), 2) the generation of ideas and text, and 3) substantive research. The Recommendations have been tailored for application to these different uses.

WAME Recommendations on Chatbots and Generative Artificial Intelligence in Relation to Scholarly Publication

WAME Recommendation 1: Chatbots cannot be authors. Journals have begun to publish articles in which chatbots such as Bard, Bing and ChatGPT have been used, with some journals listing chatbots as co-authors. The legal status of an author differs from country to country but under most jurisdictions, an author must be a legal person. Chatbots do not meet the International Committee of Medical Journal Editors (ICMJE) authorship criteria, particularly that of being able to give "final approval of the version to be published" and "to be accountable for all aspects of the work in ensuring that questions related to the accuracy or integrity of any part of the work are appropriately investigated and resolved."10 No AI tool can "understand" a conflict-of-interest statement, and does not have the legal standing to sign a statement. Chatbots have no affiliation independent of their developers. Since authors submitting a manuscript must ensure that all those named as authors meet the authorship criteria, chatbots cannot be included as authors.

WAME Recommendation 2: Authors should be transparent when chatbots are used and provide information about how they were used. The extent and type of use of chatbots in journal publications should be indicated. This is consistent with the ICMJE recommendation of acknowledging writing assistance¹¹ and providing in the Methods detailed information about how the study was conducted and the results generated.¹²

WAME Recommendations 2.1: Authors submitting a paper in which a chatbot/AI was used to draft new text should note such use in the acknowledgment; all prompts used to generate new text, or to convert text or text prompts into tables or illustrations, should be specified.

WAME Recommendation 2.2: When an AI tool such as a chatbot is used to carry out or generate analytical work, help report results

(e.g., generating tables or figures), or write computer codes, this should be stated in the body of the paper, in both the Abstract and the Methods section. In the interests of enabling scientific scrutiny, including replication and identifying falsification, the full prompt used to generate the research results, the time and date of query, and the AI tool used and its version, should be provided.

WAME Recommendation 3: Authors are responsible for material provided by a chatbot in their paper (including the accuracy of what is presented and the absence of plagiarism) and for appropriate attribution of all sources (including original sources for material generated by the chatbot). Authors of articles written with the help of a chatbot are responsible for the material generated by the chatbot, including its accuracy. Noting that plagiarism is "the practice of taking someone else's work or ideas and passing them off as one's own"13, not just the verbatim repetition of previously published text. It is the author's responsibility to ensure that the content reflects the author's data and ideas and is not plagiarism, fabrication or falsification. Otherwise, it is potentially scientific misconduct to offer such material for publication, irrespective of how it was written. Similarly, authors must ensure that all quoted material is appropriately attributed, including full citations, and that the cited sources support the chatbot's statements. Since a chatbot may be designed to omit sources that oppose viewpoints expressed in its output, it is the authors' responsibility to find, review and include such counterviews in their articles. (Of course, such biases are also found in human authors.) Authors should identify the chatbot used and the specific prompt (query statement) used with the chatbot. They should specify what they have done to mitigate the risk of plagiarism, provide a balanced view, and ensure the accuracy of all their references.

WAME Recommendation 4: Editors and peer reviewers should specify, to authors and each other, any use of chatbots in the evaluation of the manuscript and generation of reviews and correspondence. If they use chatbots in their communications with authors and each other, they should explain how they were used. Editors and reviewers are responsible for any content and citations generated by a chatbot. They should be aware that chatbots retain the prompts fed to them, including manuscript content, and supplying an author's manuscript to a chatbot breaches confidentiality of the submitted manuscript.

WAME Recommendation 5: Editors need appropriate tools to help them detect content generated or altered by AI. Such tools should be made available to editors regardless of ability to pay for them, for the good of science and the public, and to help ensure the integrity of healthcare information and reducing the risk of adverse health outcomes. Many medical journal editors use manuscript evaluation approaches that were not designed to deal with AI innovations and industries, including manipulated plagiarized text and images and papermill-generated documents. They have already been at a disadvantage when trying to differentiate the legitimate from the fabricated, and chatbots take this challenge to a new level. Editors need access to tools that will help them evaluate content efficiently and accurately. This is of particular importance to editors of medical journals where the adverse consequences of misinformation include potential harms to people.

We encourage comments and feedback from WAME Members and other readers. Please contact us at <chris@chriszielinski.com>.

Competing Interests: All of the authors report that they have no competing interests aside from any affiliations as editors.

REFERENCES

- 1: What is a chatbot? Oracle Cloud Infrastructure. [Accessed May 27, 2023].
- Copeland BJ (fact-checked by the Editors of Encyclopaedia Britannica). Artificial intelligence. Britannica Last Updated: May 26, 2023). [Accessed May 27, 2023].
- 3: Gui J, Sun Z, Wen Y, Tao D, and Ye J. A review on generative adversarial networks: Algorithms theory and applications. IEEE Trans Knowl Data Eng. 2023; 35:3313-3332. DOI: 10.1109/TKDE.2021.3130191.
- 4: Abukmeil M, Ferrari S, Genovese A, Piuri V, Scotti F. A survey of unsupervised generative models for exploratory data analysis and representation learning. ACM Comput Surv. 2021;54(5):1-40.
- 5: Wun STY, He SZ, Liu JP, Sun SQ, Liu K, Han QL, Tang Y. A brief overview of ChatGPT: The history, status quo and potential future development. IEEE/CAA J Autom Sinica. 2023;10 (5):1122–1136. DOI: 10.1109/JAS.2023.123618
- Bhuiyan J. Open AI CEO calls for laws to mitigate 'risks of increasingly powerful' AI. The Guardian. May 16, 2023. [Accessed May 27, 2023].
- 7: Appel G, Neelbauer J, Schweidel DA. Generative AI Has an Intellectual Property Problem.

 April 07, 2023. Harvard Business Review.

 [Accessed May 27, 2023].
- 8: Thorbecke C. Don't tell anything to a chatbot you want to keep private. CNN Business. April 6, 2023. [Accessed May 27, 2023].
- Recommendations for the Conduct, Reporting, Editing, and Publication of Scholarly Work in Medical Journals. Updated May 2023. [Accessed May 27, 2023].
- Who Is an Author? Defining the Role of Authors and Contributors. ICMJE. [Accessed May 27, 2023].
- 11: Non-Author Contributors. Defining the Role of Authors and Contributors. ICMJE. [Accessed May 27, 2023].
- 12: Methods. Preparing a Manuscript for Submission to a Medical Journal. ICMJE. [Accessed May 27, 2023].
- 13: Plagiarism. Oxford Reference. [Accessed May 27, 2023].

Cite as: Zielinski C, Winker MA, Aggarwal R, Ferris LE, Heinemann M, Lapeña JF, Pai SA, Ing E, Citrome L, Alam M, Voight M, Habibzadeh F, for the WAME Board. Chatbots, Generative AI, and Scholarly Manuscripts. WAME Recommendations on Chatbots and Generative Artificial Intelligence in Relation to Scholarly Publications. WAME. May 31, 2023. https://wame.org/page3.php?id=106

WAME encourages WAME Members to republish this statement in their journals with attribution to the original publication on WAME.org. WAME will list journal citations and links to the re-publications on this page. Please contact Margaret Winker at mwinker@wame.org with any questions.

This statement has been republished in the following journals:

Philippine Journal of Otolaryngology Head and Neck Surgery. 2023 Jun. 4;38(1):7-9. Available from: https://pjohns.pso-hns.org/index.php/pjohns/article/view/2135

Global Journal of Medicine & Public Health. 2023; 12(2). https://www.gjmedph.com//Uploads/E1_Vol12_No2_2023.pdf

Open Access Macedonian Journal of Medical Sciences. 2023;11(A):263-5. https://doi.org/10.3889/oamjms.2023.11723

Philippine Journal of Pathology. 2023; 8(1),6–8. https://philippinejournalofpathology.org/index.php/PJP/article/view/405

Journal of Postgraduate Medical Institute. 2023; 37(3). https://doi.org/10.54079/jpmi.37.3.3284https://jpmi.org.pk/index.php/jpmi/article/view/3284

National Medical Journal of India. 2023; 36 (1):1-4. doi: 10.25259/NMJI_365_23 https://nmji.in/chatbots-chatgpt-and-scholarly-manuscripts-wame-

recommendations-on-chatgpt-and-chatbots-in-relation-to-scholarly-publications/

Colombia Médica (Cali),2023; 54 (3):e1015868. http://doi.org/10.25100/cm.v54i3.5868 https://colombiamedica.univalle.edu.co/index.php/comedica/article/view/5868/5761

Current Medical Research and Opinion, 2024; 40:1, 11-13, DOI: 10.1080/03007995.2023.2286102 https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1080/03007995.2023.2286102

Brunei International Medical Journal, 2024;20:3-7. Available at http://www.bimjonline.com/PDF/BIMJ2024;20/BIMJ2024-20-3-7/BIMJ2024-20-3-7.pdf

Spanish:

Recomendaciones de WAME sobre "chatbots" e inteligencia artificial generativa en relación con las publicaciones académicas. Colombia Médica. 2023;54(3):e1015868. https://colombiamedica.univalle.edu.co/index.php/comedica/article/view/5868/5764

WAME (2023), Creative Commons BY-NC-ND

LICENSE

This work is licensed under a Creative Commons

Attribution-NonCommercialNoDerivatives 4.0 International License.